# Arrangements of Stars on the American Flag 

Johann Thiel - City Tech<br>Dimitris Koukoulopoulos - CRM

April 28, 2024

## The Union Jack

- The Jack of the United States, or Union Jack, is the blue portion of the American flag containing one star for each state.


Current Union Jack

- From 1777 to 2002, the Union Jack was the official maritime flag representing the United States.


## Puerto Rico

- In Chris Wilson's Slate article, 13 Stripes and 51 Stars, he mentions the possibility that Puerto Rico may vote to become the $51^{\text {st }}$ state.
- Problem: How do we add an additional star to the Union Jack so that is looks "nice?"

- How was this problem resolved in 1959 and 1960?
- Robert G. Heft!


Long - 50 Stars


Equal - 48 Stars

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star
\end{aligned}
$$

Wyoming - 32 Stars
$\star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star$
$\star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star$
$\star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star$
$\star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star$
$\star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star$

Short - 42 Stars

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star
\end{aligned}
$$

Alternate - 45 Stars

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star \\
& \star \star \star \star \star \star \star
\end{aligned}
$$

Oregon - 33 Stars

## 1 to 100 Stars

- Heft designed arrangements for a flag with 51 to 60 stars.
- Skip Garibaldi created a program that finds arrangements for 1 to 100 stars using the arrangements from the previous slide.
- The $N$ States of America (no longer working)
- What about 29, 69, and 87 ?


## The Problem with 29

Let $a$ and $b$ represent the number of rows and columns of stars on a 29-star flag.

- For the equal arrangement, we need $29=a b$ with

$$
1 \leq b / a \leq 2
$$

- For the Oregon arrangement, we need $31=29+2=a b$ with $1 \leq b / a \leq 2$.
- For the Wyoming arrangement, we need $27=29-2=a b$ with $a$ and $b$ close to each other.
- For the remaining arrangements (long, short), we need 59 or 57 to factor as a product $a b$ with $a$ and $b$ close to each other.


## Characterization of Arrangements

A nice arrangement of $n$ stars on the Union Jack exists if at least one of the following holds:
(i) For the long pattern, $2 n-1=(2 a+1)(2 b+1)$ with

$$
1 \leq(b+1) /(2 a+1) \leq 2
$$

(ii) For the short pattern, $2 n+1=(2 a-1)(2 b+1)$ with

$$
1 \leq(b+1) /(2 a+1) \leq 2
$$

(iii) For the alternate pattern, $n=a(2 b-1)$ with $1 \leq b /(2 a) \leq 2$.
(iv) For the Wyoming pattern, $n-2=a b$ with $1 \leq(b+1) / a \leq 2$.
(v) For the equal pattern, $n=a b$ with $1 \leq b / a \leq 2$.
(vi) For the Oregon pattern, $n+2=a b$ with $1 \leq b / a \leq 2$.

## Notation

- We write $f(N)=O(g(N))$ if

$$
|f(N)| \leq c|g(N)|
$$

for some constant $c>0$ as $N \rightarrow \infty$.

- For a set of non-negative integers $A$, we call

$$
\lim _{N \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\#\{n \leq N: n \in A\}}{N}
$$

the asymptotic density of $A$.

- Let $\Omega(n)=\sum_{\substack{p^{a} \mid n \\ a \geq 1}} 1$.
- $\Omega(20)=\Omega(4)+\Omega(5)=2+1=3$
- One can show that $\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n \leq N} \Omega(n)=\log \log N+O(1)$.
- For $n \leq 10^{100}, \Omega(n) \approx 6$.


## Sketch of the proof for $\Omega(n)$

Theorem (Mertens)
We have that

$$
\sum_{p \leq N} \frac{1}{p}=\log \log N+O(1)
$$

## Sketch of the proof for $\Omega(n)$

From Mertens' result, it follows that

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n \leq N} \Omega(n) & =\frac{1}{N} \sum_{\substack{n \leq N}} \sum_{\substack{p^{a} \mid n \\
a \geq 1}} 1 \\
& =\frac{1}{N} \sum_{\substack{p^{a} \leq N \\
a \geq 1}} \sum_{\substack{n \leq N \\
p^{a} \mid n}} 1 \\
& =\frac{1}{N} \sum_{\substack{p^{a} \leq N \\
a \geq 1}}\left(\frac{N}{p^{a}}+O(1)\right) \\
& =\sum_{p \leq N} \frac{1}{p}+O\left(\sum_{p \text { prime }} \frac{1}{p^{a}}\right)=\log \log N+O(1) .
\end{aligned}
$$

Theorem (Hardy, Ramanujan)
For any $\epsilon>0$,

$$
\lim _{N \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{N} \#\{n \leq N:|\Omega(n)-\log \log N| \leq \epsilon \log \log N\}=1
$$

## The Multiplication Table Problem

| $\times$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| 2 | 2 | 4 | 6 | 8 | 10 | 12 | 14 | 16 | 18 | 20 |
| 3 | 3 | 6 | 9 | 12 | 15 | 18 | 21 | 24 | 27 | 30 |
| 4 | 4 | 8 | 12 | 16 | 20 | 24 | 28 | 32 | 36 | 40 |
| 5 | 5 | 10 | 15 | 20 | 25 | 30 | 35 | 40 | 45 | 50 |
| 6 | 6 | 12 | 18 | 24 | 30 | 36 | 42 | 48 | 54 | 60 |
| 7 | 7 | 14 | 21 | 28 | 35 | 42 | 49 | 56 | 63 | 70 |
| 8 | 8 | 16 | 24 | 32 | 40 | 48 | 56 | 64 | 72 | 80 |
| 9 | 9 | 18 | 27 | 36 | 45 | 54 | 63 | 72 | 81 | 90 |
| 10 | 10 | 20 | 30 | 40 | 50 | 60 | 70 | 80 | 90 | 100 |

## The Multiplication Table Problem

| $\times$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  | 12 | 14 | 16 | 18 | 20 |
| 3 |  |  |  |  | 15 |  | 21 | 24 | 27 | 30 |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 28 | 32 | 36 | 40 |
| 5 |  |  |  |  | 25 |  | 35 |  | 45 | 50 |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 42 | 48 | 54 | 60 |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 49 | 56 | 63 | 70 |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 64 | 72 | 80 |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 81 | 90 |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 100 |

## Heuristic argument

- Let $A(N)=\#\left\{n \leq N: n=n_{1} n_{2}, n_{i} \leq \sqrt{N}\right\}$
- Suppose $n$ is in the multiplication table where the axis ranges from 1 to $\sqrt{N}$.
- $n=n_{1} n_{2} \Rightarrow \Omega(n)=\Omega\left(n_{1}\right)+\Omega\left(n_{2}\right) \approx 2 \log \log \sqrt{N}$
- This implies that $\Omega(n) \approx 2 \log \log N$, which is not very common.
Note: $\log \log \sqrt{N}=\log \log N+\log \log 1 / 2 \approx \log \log N$.
- We expect $A(N)$ to be small.


## A more complete argument

Suppose that $n$ is an integer counted by $A(N)$. Then $n=n_{1} n_{2}$ with $n_{1}, n_{2} \leq \sqrt{N}$ and either

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Case 1: } \Omega\left(n_{1}\right)<\frac{2}{3} \log \log N \text { or } \\
& \text { Case 2: } \Omega\left(n_{2}\right) \geq \Omega\left(n_{1}\right) \geq \frac{2}{3} \log \log N \Rightarrow \Omega(n) \geq \frac{4}{3} \log \log N .
\end{aligned}
$$

The number of integers $n \leq N$ counted by Case 1 is at most

$$
\#\left\{n_{1} \leq \sqrt{N}: \Omega\left(n_{1}\right) \leq \frac{2}{3} \log \log N\right\} \cdot \#\left\{n_{2} \leq \sqrt{N}\right\}
$$

The number of integers $n \leq N$ counted by Case 2 is at most

$$
\#\left\{n \leq N: \Omega(n) \geq \frac{4}{3} \log \log N\right\}
$$

## A more complete argument

So

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{A(N)}{N} \leq & \frac{1}{\sqrt{N}} \#\left\{n_{1} \leq \sqrt{N}: \Omega\left(n_{1}\right) \leq \frac{2}{3} \log \log N\right\} \\
& \quad+\frac{1}{N} \#\left\{n \leq N: \Omega(n) \geq \frac{4}{3} \log \log N\right\} \\
& \rightarrow 0
\end{aligned}
$$

as $N \rightarrow \infty$.

## Results on $A(N)$

Erdős (1960)

$$
A(N)=O_{\epsilon}\left(\frac{N}{(\log N)^{\delta-\epsilon}}\right), \delta=1-\frac{1+\log \log 2}{\log 2}=0.086071 \ldots
$$

Hall-Tenenbaum (1988)

$$
A(N)=O\left(\frac{N}{(\log N)^{\delta} \sqrt{\log \log N}}\right)
$$

Ford (2008)

$$
A(N) \asymp \frac{N}{(\log N)^{\delta}(\log \log N)^{3 / 2}}
$$

## Equal Patterns

- Let $n \leq N$ be such that it admits an equal star arrangement.
- So $n=a b$ with $1 \leq \frac{b}{a} \leq 2$.
- $a \leq b \leq 2 a \Rightarrow \sqrt{n} \leq b \leq 2 \sqrt{n}$.
- In particular, $a, b \leq 2 \sqrt{N}$, so $n$ is counted by $A(4 N)$.
- This implies that such $n$ have asymptotic density 0 .

Note: We can argue in a similar way for the remaining arrangements.

Theorem (Koukoulopoulos, T)
The set of non-negative integers allowing for a nice arrangement of $n$ stars on the U.S. flag has asymptotic density zero.

Thank you!

